Evaluating Factors Affecting the Effectiveness of Customer Service Training Programs: A Study of IOH Outlets in Jakarta

Vania Talitha Nada¹, Nur Arief Rahmatsyah Putranto, S.T, M.HRMHons.²
¹,² School of Business and Management Bandung (ITB)
Jl. Ganesa 10, Bandung

ABSTRACT: In the dynamic telecommunications market of Indonesia, quality customer service is pivotal for sustaining competitive advantage. IOH faces persistent challenges in meeting customer service expectations, evidenced by consistent customer complaints regarding the customer service representative performance despite extensive training programs for their representatives. This study aims to evaluate the effectiveness of IOH's customer service training programs in Jakarta, identifying key factors influencing training effectiveness and proposing improvements. Utilizing a quantitative approach, a survey was conducted among 49 customer service representatives, and the data were analyzed using spearman rank correlation. The results revealed that training content, method, schedule, and facilities significantly impact training effectiveness, with training content identified as the most influential. Improved training content to be more relevant with the needs of representatives, implement the diverse and interactive methods, well-structured schedules, and utilize the high-quality facilities can enhance the effectiveness of training programs. These strategies will enhance the competency and confidence of customer service representatives, ultimately improving customer satisfaction. Future research should explore personalized training approaches tailored to individual needs and assess the long-term impacts of training programs and expanding the study beyond Jakarta will provide a more comprehensive understanding of training effectiveness across different regions. By addressing these recommendations, IOH can significantly improve their customer service training programs, leading to higher service quality and customer satisfaction.

KEYWORDS: Training Effectiveness, Training Content, Training Method, Training Schedule, Training Facilities

INTRODUCTION

As Indonesia embraces the digital era, the nation's internet adoption reflects its technological progress. A survey by the Indonesian Internet Service Providers Association (APJII) revealed that in 2024, Indonesia had 221 million internet users, with an internet penetration rate of 79.5%, marking a 1.31% increase from the previous year. This growth positions Indonesia as one of the world's fastest-growing telecommunications markets, with both mobile and fixed broadband subscriptions increasing significantly (APJII, 2024). Despite a downturn in 2018 due to government SIM registration restrictions, mobile subscriber numbers continue to rise, driven by a dynamic mix of domestic and international players competing for market share (Business Wire, 2022; International Trade Administration, 2024).

In Indonesia's competitive telecommunications market, major providers like Telkomsel Indonesia, Indosat IOH, and XL Axiata strive to attract the smartphone-savvy population with enticing deals. Telkom Indonesia holds a dominant 62.8% share of total revenue from mobile subscriptions as of 2022, followed by IOH Ooredoo Hutchison and XL Axiata (Statista, 2022). IOH, the second-largest player, reported a significant 9.6% year-over-year revenue growth in 2023 (IOH, 2023). To sustain and enhance its competitive edge, IOH must continuously improve and uphold quality service for its customers, focusing on retaining existing customers as market growth slows or competition intensifies (Lee et al., 2001).

Delivering exceptional customer experiences is crucial for IOH, particularly through its customer service representatives at outlets. The quality of service provided by these representatives directly impacts customer satisfaction. Service quality, comprising five dimensions—Reliability, Responsiveness, Assurance, Empathy, and Tangibles—significantly influences customer satisfaction (Kotler, 2010). Factors such as the physical environment of service outlets, wait times, and the attitudes and behaviors of customer service representatives play critical roles in shaping customer perceptions and satisfaction (Choi, 2020; Palawatta, 2015; Zeithaml et al., 2009).
Despite IOH’s efforts to improve service quality, its customer service representatives face significant challenges in satisfying customers. Data from MediaKonsumen.com and IOH reveal persistent issues with customer service at IOH outlets, particularly in addressing complaints. Interviews with the Head of Jakarta outlets show that the target is to have fewer than ten customer complaints regarding services at their outlets each month. However, data for 2024 indicates that the number of unsatisfied customers with the customer service representative performance remains above the target, with complaints often revolving around inconsistent information, lack of responsiveness, and unfulfilled complaint handling (MediaKonsumen.com, 2024; IOH, 2024).

Table 1. Number of Unsatisfied Customer on Services at IOH Outlets

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Month</th>
<th>January</th>
<th>February</th>
<th>March</th>
<th>April</th>
<th>May</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of unsatisfied</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: IOH (2024)

To address these challenges, training and development are vital for enhancing employee performance and bridging the gap between customer expectations and actual service delivery (Rodriguez & Walters, 2017; Rahman & Nurbiyati, 2015). Training effectiveness, defined as the success of a training program in producing significant changes in employee behavior, knowledge, and skills, improving organizational performance and efficiency, and achieving its stated goals, such as increasing customer satisfaction (Yunitasari & Fauzan, 2023). IOH’s training programs for customer service representatives cover a broad range of content, including Product Knowledge Training, Complaint Handling Training, Service Excellence Training, and Application Training, with schedules varying between 3-6 months. Despite this comprehensive approach, a preliminary survey and interviews with customer service representatives at IOH outlets in Jakarta revealed issues with the training components, such as a significant gap in practical application, particularly in complaint handling and application usage, uncertain training schedules, a method overly focused on theoretical aspects, and suboptimal facilities, all of which lead to difficulties in day-to-day operations. By identifying and addressing these factors, this study aims to evaluate the training of customer service representatives at IOH outlets in Jakarta using Kirkpatrick’s model, focusing on the learning, reaction, and behavior levels. Additionally, the study seeks to design more effective training programs to improve customer service quality at IOH outlets by proposing improvements to training content, methods, schedules, and facilities to ensure a more practical and impactful training experience.

CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

![Figure 1. Conceptual Framework](image-url)
The hypothesis proposed in this research is:

H1: Training Content has a positive influence on Training Effectiveness
H2: Training Method has a positive influence on Training Effectiveness
H3: Training Schedule has a positive influence on Training Effectiveness
H4: Training Facilities has a positive influence on Training Effectiveness

METHODOLOGY

This study employs a quantitative method in the form of survey to provide clear, measurable insights into how different factors such as training content, method, schedule, and facilities influence training effectiveness on customer services at IOH outlets in Jakarta, offering a numerical depiction of the characteristics of a sample or the entire population being studied. A survey design provides reliable and valid quantitative descriptions of trends, attitudes, and opinions within a population, making it an effective tool for testing hypotheses and building theoretical frameworks (Creswell, 2018).

Research Objects, Population, and Samples

This research focuses on evaluating the effectiveness of customer service training at IOH outlets in Jakarta. The study targets customer service representatives at these outlets to ensure a thorough understanding of the factors influencing training effectiveness. The population consists of all customer service representatives at IOH outlets, with a sample of 49 representatives selected across nine outlets in Jakarta. A purposive sampling technique is employed to ensure that respondents have experience with the customer service training programs, providing valuable insights into the factors affecting training effectiveness.

Data Collection Technique

The data collection process for this research involved several stages. Initially, preliminary interviews were conducted with six customer service representatives to gather information about the customer service training they had received, providing qualitative insights into the existing training programs and identifying potential areas for improvement. Following these interviews, a preliminary questionnaire was distributed to eight customer service representatives to identify specific issues related to training effectiveness and gather initial data. Subsequently, a more extensive quantitative data collection phase was conducted, involving the distribution of questionnaires to 49 customer service representatives at IOH outlets in Jakarta, aiming to gather detailed and statistically significant data. The questionnaire consisted of 25 closed-ended questions organized into five sections: demographic information, training content, training method, training schedule, and training facilities. These questions were adapted from previous studies to ensure relevance and comprehensiveness. To capture respondents' stances, a six-point Likert scale was used, intentionally eliminating a neutral midpoint to compel more precise insights, ranging from "strongly disagree" to "strongly agree." This structured approach allowed for a thorough analysis of the factors affecting training effectiveness at IOH outlets.

Data Analysis Technique

The data analysis involves several steps to ensure the validity and reliability of the collected data. The validity test includes content, face, and construct validity, with Pearson's correlation used to assess the strength of the linear relationship between variables. Validity is determined by comparing the calculated correlation coefficient with the critical value at a significance level of $\alpha = 0.05$. Reliability is measured using Cronbach’s alpha, with a threshold of 0.60 indicating acceptable reliability (Ghazali, 2009).

Classical assumption tests, including normality, multicollinearity, and heteroscedasticity tests, are conducted to validate the regression model. Given that the data did not pass the classical assumption test, the Spearman rank correlation test is employed as a nonparametric measure to assess the strength of the relationship between the independent and dependent variables. This test evaluates the developed hypotheses, identifies relationships between variables, and measures the overall effectiveness of the training programs (Hauke & Kossowski, 2011). The results of the Spearman rank correlation test are used to provide a comprehensive picture of the factors influencing training effectiveness and to formulate conclusions and recommendations for improving customer service training at IOH outlets in Jakarta.
RESULT
Validity Test
Validity test ensures that a research instrument accurately measures the intended variable and pertains to the interpretation of the scores obtained from that instrument (Puspitasari & Febrinita, 2021). An indicator is considered valid if it has a correlation coefficient with an r count greater than the r table value. In this research, the sample size (N) is 49, so the degree of freedom is determined by the formula df = N - 2, which results in df = 47. The r table value is determined by looking at the two-tailed test probability with a significance level (α) of 0.05, yielding an r table value of 0.2816. Therefore, for an indicator to be significant in this research, its correlation coefficient must exceed 0.2816.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>r count</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training Content</td>
<td>TC1</td>
<td>0.395</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TC2</td>
<td>0.413</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TC3</td>
<td>0.372</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TC4</td>
<td>0.290</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TC5</td>
<td>0.446</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Method</td>
<td>TM1</td>
<td>0.391</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TM2</td>
<td>0.695</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TM3</td>
<td>0.433</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TM4</td>
<td>0.733</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TM5</td>
<td>0.446</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TM6</td>
<td>0.525</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Schedule</td>
<td>TS1</td>
<td>0.312</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TS2</td>
<td>0.330</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TS3</td>
<td>0.657</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training</td>
<td>TF1</td>
<td>0.377</td>
<td>Valid</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Based on the result, it shows each indicator under each variable is valid since all the r counts more than the r table (0.281). This confirms that each item is statistically valid which confirms that they accurately measure the variable.

**Reliability Test**

Reliability measures the consistency or stability of a questionnaire's indicators over time, confirmed using Cronbach’s alpha (α) to assess the correlation between each test item and the total of the remaining items (Ghazali, 2009). The questions are considered reliable if the Cronbach’s Alpha coefficient is greater than 0.60.

**Table 3. Reliability Test Result**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Cronbach’s Alpha</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Reliability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training Content (TC)</td>
<td>0.962</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Reliable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Method (TM)</td>
<td>0.827</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Reliable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Schedule (TS)</td>
<td>0.630</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Reliable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Facilities (TF)</td>
<td>0.734</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Reliable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Effectiveness (TE)</td>
<td>0.945</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Reliable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The test results above represent all variables in the study exhibit Cronbach’s alpha coefficients well above the 0.60 threshold which confirm that the questionnaire’s items are consistent and reliable for measuring the intended constructs.

Hypothesis Testing Results

The Spearman rank correlation test was utilized to evaluate the relationships between various factors and training effectiveness, as the data was not normally distributed (Sugiyono, 2019) with a confidence level of 95% or a significance level of 0.05 ($\alpha = 0.05$).

Table 4. Spearman Rank Correlation Test Result

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Training Content</th>
<th>Correlation Coefficient</th>
<th>Sig. (2-tailed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training Schedule</td>
<td>0.505*</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training Facilities</td>
<td>0.784**</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first hypothesis testing showed that training content significantly influences training effectiveness, with a correlation coefficient ($\rho$) of 0.796 and a significance value ($p$-value) of less than 0.001, indicating a strong positive relationship. Similarly, the training method also demonstrated a significant positive impact on training effectiveness, with a correlation coefficient of 0.721 and a p-value of less than 0.001. This strong positive correlation suggests that improvements in training methods lead to enhanced training outcomes.

Further analysis revealed that the training schedule positively influences training effectiveness, with a correlation coefficient of 0.505 and a p-value of less than 0.001, indicating a moderate positive relationship. Lastly, the training facilities showed a significant positive impact on training effectiveness, with a correlation coefficient of 0.784 and a p-value of less than 0.001, highlighting the importance of well-equipped and conducive training environments for effective training programs.

DISCUSSION

**H1: Training Content has a positive influence on Training Effectiveness**

The results of the hypothesis testing confirm that training content has a significant positive influence on training effectiveness, as evidenced by a strong and statistically significant correlation. This indicates that improvements in the design and structure of training content lead to enhanced training outcomes, emphasizing the importance of well-crafted materials. The findings align with previous research by Khraai and Mashau (2020) and Lim and Johnson (2002), which highlight the critical role of relevant and well-structured training content in enhancing the learning experience and aligning with learners' needs and organizational goals. This underscores the necessity for IOH to prioritize the continuous review and enhancement of their training content to achieve optimal training effectiveness especially for the complaint handling and application content.
H2: Training Method has a positive influence on Training Effectiveness

The hypothesis that training methods positively influence training effectiveness is confirmed by a strong and statistically significant correlation. This indicates that improvements in the quality and implementation of training methods lead to enhanced training outcomes. The findings suggest that diverse and interactive training methods, such as role-plays, simulations, and hands-on activities, significantly improve learning experiences and performance of customer service representatives. This aligns with research by Cahyaningrum et al. (2023), which highlights the effectiveness of combining various training methods to maximize outcomes. Therefore, IOH should focus on incorporating a variety of engaging and practical training methods to further improve the effectiveness of their training programs.

H3: Training Schedule has a positive influence on Training Effectiveness

The hypothesis that the training schedule positively influences training effectiveness is supported by a strong and statistically significant correlation, indicating that improvements in the training schedule lead to enhanced training outcomes. This finding suggests that providing a well-defined and clear schedule improves participants’ preparedness and satisfaction, ensuring they have adequate time to learn and practice new skills. Previous studies by Kontoghiorghes (2003) and Kennedy (2009) highlight the importance of continuous learning environments and regularly scheduled sessions to keep employees updated and reinforce their skills. Additionally, Budiastruti et al. (2023) emphasize that optimized training schedules result in stronger training gains within a shorter time frame, underscoring the crucial role of a well-structured training schedule in enhancing overall training effectiveness.

H4: Training Facilities has a positive influence on Training Effectiveness

The hypothesis that training facilities positively influence training effectiveness is confirmed by a strong and statistically significant correlation, indicating that enhancements in training facilities lead to improved training outcomes. The analysis reveals that cleanliness and comfort are highly appreciated by participants, while there is a need for improvement in technological facilities and training aids. This aligns with previous studies by Gallucci and Petersen (2017) and Mohanty et al. (2019), which emphasize that adequate and well-equipped training facilities support the learning process by providing necessary resources and a conducive environment. Therefore, prioritizing investments in high-quality technological facilities and maintaining high standards of cleanliness and comfort are essential for maximizing training effectiveness.

CONCLUSION

The primary objectives of this research were to identify the relationship between various training factors and training effectiveness and to determine which factor has the most significant impact. To achieve these objectives, a quantitative method was employed, distributing a questionnaire via Google Forms to 49 customer service representatives at IOH outlets in Jakarta. The collected data was then analyzed using SPSS, focusing on the influence of training content, training method, training schedule, and training facilities on training effectiveness. The results provide valuable insights into how each factor contributes to the overall effectiveness of the training programs, emphasizing the key areas that enhance the skills and performance of customer service representatives at IOH outlets in Jakarta.

RQ1: Does the overall effectiveness of training have a relationship with each factor of training (training content, training method, training schedule, and training facilities)?

The findings from the hypothesis testing revealed that each factor of the training program has a significant positive influence on overall training effectiveness. Participants’ perceptions of training effectiveness are significantly influenced by the training’s content, method, schedule, and facilities. This is evidenced by the Spearman rank test correlation coefficients, which were all positive and significant for each factor. These results indicate that well-designed and thoughtfully implemented training content, engaging training methods, well-planned training schedules, and adequate training facilities are crucial for enhancing the effectiveness of training programs.

RQ2: What is the most impactful factor that could be efficiently tackled by IOH to increase their training effectiveness on the customer service representatives at Outlet?

Training content emerged as the most impactful factor that IOH could efficiently tackle to increase the effectiveness of their training programs. By focusing on enhancing the content used to deliver training, IOH can achieve significant improvements in training outcomes for their customer service representatives, particularly at the outlets in Jakarta. This aligns with previous studies, which highlight the importance of well-structured and relevant training content in achieving effective training results.
Consequently, prioritizing the improvement of training content will provide the greatest benefit in enhancing the skills and performance of IOH’s customer service representatives.

RECOMMENDATION

Based on the findings of this research, several recommendations are proposed to significantly increase the effectiveness of IOH’s customer service training programs. Firstly, IOH should regularly review and update the training content to keep it relevant and aligned with current industry standards and customer expectations. This involves incorporating the latest best practices, tools, and techniques in customer service, and gathering feedback from customer service representatives to address emerging needs or gaps in the training. Enhancing training programs with comprehensive content on complaint handling and application training will ensure representatives are well-equipped to manage and resolve customer complaints effectively.

Utilizing a variety of training methods, such as simulations, role-playing, and team training, will improve understanding and retention by allowing participants to engage in realistic scenarios. This approach makes the training more engaging and ensures that agents can apply their training directly to their daily tasks, increasing their competency and confidence in handling customer issues. Standardizing the training schedule to conduct sessions quarterly, supplemented with regular skill refreshment sessions, will help maintain high customer service standards and address the feedback from customer service representatives who recommend more frequent refreshment training.

Moreover, IOH should invest in cutting-edge training facilities equipped with the latest tools and supplies to create an optimal learning environment. High-quality training facilities, including advanced applications and systems for training purposes, are likely to yield improved learning results. Incorporating essential training aids such as LCD/TV Plasma screens for presentations and basic supplies like ballpoint pens and notebooks can significantly enhance the training experience. Training programs should be designed to appeal to younger demographics, utilizing interactive and technology-driven methods. Additionally, providing on-the-job training and continuous professional development programs will help bridge the gap between current capabilities and expected service quality standards.

Future research could explore additional factors influencing the effectiveness of customer service training programs, such as the impact of personalized training programs tailored to individual needs and learning styles. Expanding research to include areas beyond Jakarta could provide a more comprehensive understanding of training effectiveness across different regions. Conducting longitudinal studies to assess the long-term impact of training programs on employee performance and career progression can further contribute to the development of more effective and impactful training programs.

REFERENCES


The Importance of Training and Development in Employee Performance and a Case Study of Board Members of Non-Profit Organizations in Gauteng.


